

PRESIDENT
Deepak Goradia

IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT
Nayan A. Shah

PRESIDENT-ELECT
Boman Irani

SR. VICE PRESIDENTS
Harish Patel
Nainesh Shah
Domnic Romell
Bandish Ajmera

VICE PRESIDENTS
Sukhraj Nahar
Jayesh Shah
Ajay Ashar

HON. SECRETARY
Pritam Chivukula

TREASURER
Munish Doshi

SPECIAL PROJECTS
Parag Munot
Sandeep Raheja
Navin Makhija
Rasesh Kanakia
Shahid Balwa
Sudodh Runwal

HON. JT. SECRETARIES
Shailesh G. Puranik
Dhaval Ajmera
Pratik Patel

JT. TREASURERS
Mukesh Patel
Tejas Vyas

CO-ORDINATORS
Nayan Bheda
Raajesh Prajapati
Dr. Harshul Savla

COMMITTEE MEMBERS
Gautam Ahuja
Deepak Gundecha

INVITEE MEMBERS
Shailesh Sanghvi
Sachin Mirani
Nikunj Sanghavi
Rajeev Jain
Shyamal Mody
Digant Parekh
Rushank Shah
Samyag Shah
Jayesh C. Shah
Sunny Bijlani
Sahil Parikh
Naman Shah
Ricardo Romell
Binitha Dalal

PAST PRESIDENTS
Mayur Shah
Dharmesh Jain
Vyomesh Shah
Paras Gundecha
Pravin Doshi
Mohan Deshmukh
Mofatraj Munot
Rajnikant Ajmera
Late G. L. Raheja
Late Lalit Gandhi
Late Babubhai Majethia

CREDAI-MCHI UNITS

PRESIDENT, THANE
Ajay Ashar

PRESIDENT, KALYAN DOMBIVLI
Shrikant Shitole

PRESIDENT, MIRA VIRAR CITY
Ashit Shah

PRESIDENT, RAIGAD
Kiran Bagad

PRESIDENT, NAVI MUMBAI
Vijay Lakhani

Ref. No. MCHI/PRES/20-21/062

December 1, 2020

To,
Shri Milind Mhaiskar (I.A.S)
Principal Secretary (Forests)
Government of Maharashtra
Mantralya
Mumbai 400 032

20/12/20
9/12/20
प्रधान सचिव (वन) महाराष्ट्र सरकार
महसूल व वन विभाग
कोटवली, मुंबई ४०० ०३२

Subject: Gazette Notification issued by Revenue and Forests Departments dated 10th May, 2018.

Ref.: Notification issued by Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change dated 06th November 2019

Respected Sir,

We, at CREDAI-MCHI represent several real estate developers across MMR. We work towards bringing issues related to the real estate industry to the relevant government authorities in order for quick and successful redressal of these issues.

As per the schedule appended to the Notification issued by Revenue and Forests department dated 10th May 2018, a Sanctuary to be called as Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary has been notified. In this context we would like to state as under:

1. After issuing of notification dated 10th May 2018 by Revenue and Forests department, one Mr. T. N. Godavarman Thirumulpad and others filed SLP (ref. No. Writ Petition(s) (Civil) No(s). 202 / 1995) in the Honorable Supreme Court of India. In absence of an Eco Sensitive Zone (ESZ) having been defined by the State, honorable Supreme Court of India, vide its order dated 11-12-2018 have directed that an area of 10 kms around 21 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries to be declared as ESZ by MoEF. (copy enclosed as Annexure - A).
2. Further we would like to inform you that subsequently a draft notification dated 06th November 2019 was issued, wherein the buffer zone around Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary is proposed as 0 to 3.5 kms instead of 10 Km. The salient features of draft Eco Sensitive Zone are as follows:

Area of PA - 16.90 sq. km.
Proposed ESZ area - 34.05 sq. km.
Proposed Extent - 0 to 3.50 kilometers.
3. The proposal for Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary was considered in the 39th meeting of the Expert Committee of ESZ, the State of Maharashtra held on 4th February 2020 by Expert Committee of ESZ, the State of Maharashtra wherein the Committee suggested the State Govt to revise the proposal by exploring the possibility of including any forest area in ESZ.

4. Subsequently, in the 42nd meeting held on 18th August 2020 by Expert Committee of ESZ, the State of Maharashtra, in this regards the APCCF (Additional Principal Chief Conservator of Forests) informed that the revised ESZ proposal of Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary has been submitted to State Government for their approval in May 2020 and the same would be submitted to the Ministry within 15 days of the meeting. (copy enclosed as Annexure - B)

In view of above we hereby request Government of Maharashtra to expedite the submission of proposal to Ministry as proposed by ESZ Expert Committee for further issuing of final notification for the subject matter at the earliest.

Due to current situation of Corona pandemic, many developers are in huge hardships and many have RERA deadlines to complete their respective projects. Also few cases didn't have this Flamingo NOC condition in ongoing Environmental Clearance or in amended MoEF Environmental Clearance.

Thanking you,

Yours Faithfully,
For CREDAI-MCHI



Deepak Goradia
President



Pritam Chivukula
Hon. Secretary

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 202/1995

IN RE : T.N. GODAVARMAN THIRUMULPAD

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

[1] [i] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1000
[RECOMMENDATION OF CEC DATED 20.11.2003]

[ii] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 982-984
[APPLICATIONS FOR DIRECTIONS, EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. AND
IMPLEADMENT]

[iii] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1026-1028
[APPLICATIONS FOR IMPLEADMENT, DIRECTIONS AND EXEMPTION FROM
FILING O.T.]

[iv] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1123-1124
[APPLICATIONS FOR IMPLEADMENT AND DIRECTIONS]

[v] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1197-1199
[APPLICATIONS FOR IMPLEADMENT, DIRECTIONS AND EXEMPTION FROM
FILING O.T.]

[vi] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1210-1211

[APPLICATIONS FOR DIRECTIONS AND EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.]

[vii] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1250-1251
[APPLICATIONS FOR IMPLEADMENT AND DIRECTIONS]

[viii] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1412
[APPLICATION FOR CLARIFICATION OF ORDER DATED 14.07.2003]

[ix] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1512
[APPLICATION FOR FURTHER DIRECTIONS]

[x] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 1992
[APPLICATION FOR CLARIFICATION OF ORDER DATED 04.08.2006]

[xi] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NO. 3880
[APPLICATION FOR DIRECTIONS]

Signature No. 1
Digitally signed by
DEEPAK GUPTA
Date: 2014.02.11
16:54:15
Reason: WITH

[2] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NOS. 170-175, 176-178 and 186-187
IN I.A . NO. 176-177

[APPLICATIONS FOR IMPEADMENT AND DIRECTIONS] IN WRIT PETITION
(C) No. 460/2004

[3] INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION NOS. 108-113 IN W.P. (C) NO.
435/2012

[APPLICATIONS FOR APPROPRIATE DIRECTIONS AND PERMISSION TO FILE
APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION]

Date : 11-12-2018 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM : HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE MADAN B. LOKUR
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE DEEPAK GUPTA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE HEMANT GUPTA

Amicus Mr. Harish N. Salve, Sr. Adv. [A.C.][NP]

Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Advocate [A.C.]
Mr. Sudipto Sircar, Adv.

Mr. Siddhartha Chowdhury, Advocate [A.C.]

Ms. Aparajita Singh, Advocate [A.C.]

For Petitioner(s) By Courts Motion

Mr. Prashant Bhushan, Adv.
Mr. Pranav Sachdeva, Adv.

Mr. Raj Panjwani, Adv.
Ms. Purnima Bhat, Adv.

For Respondent(s) Mr. A.N.S. Nadkarni, ASG
Ms. Kiran Bhardwaj, Adv.
Mr. Anirudh Dwivedi, Adv.
Ms. Suhasini Sen, Adv.
Mr. Ritesh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. R. Bala, Adv.
Ms. Rachna Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Vikas Chaudhary, Adv.
Mr. Sachin Sharma, Adv.
Mr. S. Wasim A. Qadri, Adv.
Mr. D.L. Chidanand, Adv.
Mr. A.K. Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Aayushi Singh, Adv.
Mr. G.S. Makker, Adv.

For S.No. [1] Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Ankit Raj, Adv.
Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.

Mr. D.K. Garg, Adv.

Mr. Nirnimesh Dubey, Adv.

Smt. Suchitra A. Chitale, Adv.

Ms. Hemantika Wahi, Adv.

Mr. Tarun Johri, Adv

Mr. Arjun Garg, Adv.

Mr. Pragyan Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Mudit Makhijani, Adv.

Mr. Shikhar Garg, Adv.

Mr. P.V. Yogeshwaran, Adv.

Ms. Pratibha Jain, Adv.

Mr. Pravin H. Parekh, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Lalit Chauhan, Adv.

Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.

Mr. Sarthak Gaur, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Dash, Adv.

Mr. Vishal Prasad, Adv.

For M/S Parekh And Co.

Mr. Nishant R. Katneshwarkar, Adv.

Ms. Sumita Hazarika, Adv.

Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, Aor

Mr. Jayant Mohan, Adv.

Mr. Ivo D' Costa, Adv.

Mr. Pawan Kishor Singh, Adv.

Ms. Madhusmita Bora, Adv.

Mr. A.N.S. Nadkarni, ASG

Mr. Merusagar Samantray, Adv.

Mr. S.S. Rebello, Adv.

Mr. Leelesh Krishna, Adv.

Ms. Snehapravu Tendulkar, Adv.

Ms. Babita Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Ankit Raj, Adv.

Mr. R.C. Kohli, Adv.

Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, Adv.

Mr. Anu K. Joy, Adv.

Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv.

Mr. Reegan S. Bel, Adv.

Ms. Prabha Swami, Adv.
Ms. Divya Swami, Adv.
Mr. Nikhil Swami, Adv.

Mr. Rajesh Srivastava, Adv.

Mr. G. Seshagiri Rao, Adv.
Mr. Sridhar Potaraju, Adv.

Ms. Aruna Mathur, Adv.
Mr. Avneesh Arputham, Adv.
Ms. Anuradha Arputham, Adv.
Ms. Geetanjali, Adv.

Mr. Bhavanishankar V. Gadnis, Adv.
Mr. Jayant Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Anil Shrivastava, Adv.
Dr. Prafulla Hegde, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

The learned ASG has informed us that there are 104 National Parks and 558 Wildlife Sanctuaries making a total of 662 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries in the country.

The proposals for declaring areas around these National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries as Eco Sensitive Zone have been received from State Governments / UT Administrations for 641 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries. No proposals have been received in respect of 21 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries.

The proposals have been accepted and Notification has been issued in respect of 289 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries as on 26.11.2018 and draft Notification has been prepared in respect of 206 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries.

The declaration with regard to Eco Sensitive Zone is under process with the Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate Change (MoEF) as well as with the State Governments in respect of

146 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries.

We expect the Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate Change to actively pursue the preparation of the draft Notification and to issue a final Notification at the earliest.

The proposals for 21 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries in respect of which proposals have not yet been received by the MOEF are as follows:-

ASSAM

- 1. Pobitora Sanctuary**

JAMMU AND KASHMIR

- 2. Hemis High Altitude National Park**
- 3. Kishtewar National Park**
- 4. Changthang Sanctuary**
- 5. Hokersar Sanctuary**
- 6. Trikuta Sanctuary**

KARNATAKA

- 7. Jogimatti Sanctuary**
- 8. Thimlapura Sanctuary**
- 9. Yadahalli Chinkara Sanctuary**

MAHARASHTRA

- 10. Deolgaon Rehekuri Sanctuary**
- 11. Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary**
- 12. Malvan Marine Sanctuary**

MANIPUR

- 13. Siroi National Park**
- 14. Khongjaingamba Ching Sanctuary**

MEGHALAYA

15. Baghmara Pitcher Plant Sanctuary

NAGALAND

16. Fakim Sanctuary

17. Puliebadze Sanctuary

18. Rangapahar Sanctuary

UTTAR PRADESH

19. Dr. Bhimrao Ambedkar Bird Sanctuary

20. Pilibhit Sanctuary

WEST BENGAL

21. Jorepokhri Sanctuary

It is submitted by the learned *Amicus* that this issue has been pending since sometime in December, 2006. 12 years have gone-by but no effective steps have been taken by the State Governments in respect of the National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries mentioned above.

Under the circumstances, we direct that an area of 10 Kms around these 21 National Parks and Wildlife Sanctuaries be declared as Eco Sensitive Zone by the MoEF. The declaration be made by the MoEF at the earliest.

Liberty is granted to the State Governments to move an application for modification of this order along with proposal only two weeks after submission of the proposals to the MoEF.

List the matters at the end of February, 2019.

In the meanwhile, interim order to continue.

I.A . NO. 176-177 IN WRIT PETITION (C) No. 460/2004
[APPLICATIONS FOR IMPLEADMENT AND DIRECTIONS]

No one is present on behalf of the applicant.

The applications are dismissed.

(MEENAKSHI KOHLI)
COURT MASTER

(KAILASH CHANDER)
ASSISTANT REGISTRAR

MINUTES OF 42nd ESZ EXPERT COMMITTEE MEETING FOR THE DECLARATION OF ECO-SENSITIVE ZONE (ESZ) AROUND PROTECTED AREAS (WILDLIFE SANCTUARIES/NATIONAL PARKS/TIGER RESERVES) & ZONAL MASTER PLAN (ZMP) THROUGH VIDEO CONFERENCING (VC) HELD ON 18th AUGUST, 2020.

The 42nd Meeting of the Expert Committee on Eco-Sensitive Zone was held under the Chairmanship of Shri Ravi Agrawal, Additional Secretary on 18th August, 2020 through VC. List of participants is annexed as **Annexure-A**.

2. At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the expert members, participants from the States of Karnataka, Arunachal Pradesh, Uttarakhand, West Bengal, Assam, Odisha, Maharashtra, Andhra Pradesh, Rajasthan, Jharkhand. After a brief introduction, Chairman invited states to present their proposals.

3. Following 14 proposals for Eco-Sensitive Zone listed in the agenda were taken up *ad-seriatim*. The representatives of respective State Government presented their ESZ proposal for the consideration of Expert Committee:

S.No.	State/UT	Protected Area	Status
1.	Karnataka	Thimlapura Wildlife Sanctuary	Fresh proposal
2.	Arunachal Pradesh	Dibang Wildlife Sanctuary	Fresh proposal
3.	Uttarakhand	Nandhaur Wildlife Sanctuary	Re-notified proposal
4.	West Bengal	Gorumara National Park	Fresh proposal
5.	Assam	Chakrashila Wildlife Sanctuary	Fresh proposal
6.	Assam	Dehing Patkai Wildlife Sanctuary	Revised proposal
7.	Jharkhand	Dalma Wildlife Sanctuary	For amendment of the final notification
8.	Andhra Pradesh	Sri Venkateshwara National Park & Wildlife Sanctuary	Draft notification deferred in previous ECM meeting
9.	Telangana	Kesu Brahmananda Reddy National Park	Draft notification deferred in previous ECM meeting
10.	Maharashtra	Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary	Draft notification deferred in previous ECM meeting
11.	Odisha	Karlapat Wildlife Sanctuary	Draft notification deferred in previous ECM meeting
12.	Rajasthan	Bassi Wildlife Sanctuary	Draft notification deferred in previous ECM meeting
13.	Rajasthan	Mount Abu Wildlife Sanctuary	Draft notification deferred in previous ECM meetings
14.	Uttar Pradesh	Mahavir Swami Wildlife Sanctuary	Additional information awaited from State Govt.

4. Discussion on the ESZ proposals:

4.1. Thimlapura Wildlife Sanctuary, Karnataka

Shri. Ajai Mishra, PCCF, Forest Department, Govt. of Karnataka, made a presentation on the proposal. It was informed that the draft ESZ notification of Thimlapura Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 23rd April, 2020. The salient features of the draft Eco-sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 50.86 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 61.80 sq km

Proposed Extent : 1.00 km to 2.20 kilometre

2. Thimlapura Wildlife Sanctuary situated in the Madhugiri and Koratagere Talukas of Tumakuru District, Karnataka. The area is for the conservation and protection of the sloth bear, leopard and other endangered faunal biodiversity. The representative of the State Government requested for amendments in the notification with reference to the following activities:

(a) The activities namely, (i) Establishment of large-scale commercial livestock and poultry farms by firms, corporate and companies; (ii) Commercial use of fire wood and (iii) New wood based industry should be kept under 'Prohibited'.

(b) The activities namely, (i) Open well, bore well etc. for agriculture or other usage shall be kept under 'Regulated' activities.

(c) Solid waste management to be read as 'Solid waste management or biomedical waste management and (iii) 'Construction activities' to be read as "No new commercial construction of any kind shall be permitted within 1 km from the boundary of the Sanctuary or upto the extent of Eco-sensitive Zone whichever is nearer:

Provided that, local people shall be permitted to undertake construction in their land for their residential and local commercial use including the activities listed in sub paragraph (1) of paragraph 3 as per building byelaws to meet the residential needs of the local residents, should be kept under 'Regulated' and Plantation of Horticulture and Herbs to be kept under 'Promoted' activities.

3. Furthermore, State Government requested for inclusion of details of the Reserved Forest, Conservation Reserve area and other Forest Area falling in the Eco-sensitive Zone around Thimlapura Wildlife Sanctuary as provided in their letter while submitting the proposal.

4. It was confirmed by the State Government that the comments/objections and suggestions received from persons and stakeholders in response to the draft notification have been duly considered by the State.

5. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the Committee accepted above changes and decided to recommend the finalization of the draft with the above mentioned changes.

Additionally, the Chairman urged the State to expedite the submission of

pending ESZ proposals from the State. With respect to Karnataka, the ESZ proposals/information are still pending for Nagarhole Tiger Reserve, Bhimgad Wildlife Sanctuary, Shettihalli Wildlife Sanctuary, and Jogimatti Wildlife Sanctuary.

4.2 Dibang Wildlife Sanctuary Arunachal Pradesh

Shri. G. Kumar, PCCF, Govt. of Arunachal Pradesh, made a presentation on the proposal. It was informed that the draft ESZ notification of Dibang Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 22nd May, 2020. The salient features of the draft Eco-sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 4941 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 194.5 sq km

Proposed Extent : 0 to 1 kilometre

2. It was informed that Dibang Wildlife Sanctuary is one of the largest sanctuaries at higher altitude and holds rich biodiversity ideally suited for various floral and faunal forms, Royal Bengal Tiger and other endangered species.

3. The representative of the State requested for few corrections on the area of Wildlife Sanctuary. The total area of the PA should be read as 4149 square kilometre instead of 4941 sq km without changing the boundary of the PA. It was further informed that zero extent of Eco-sensitive Zone has been proposed in the north and eastern boundary due to border sharing with Indo-China International boundary.

4. The Committee asked the state to explore the possibility of increasing the extent beyond the proposed 1 km on the basis of natural boundaries like rivers, forests etc. The representative of the State however explained that one (1) kilometre ESZ extent is sufficient from the protection and management point of view since concerns of locals also need to be taken into account to avoid opposition and resentment among the locals. Already more than 4149 sq km area of protected area is available for the wildlife habitat and majority of the wildlife subsist on upper stretch of the Sanctuary.

5. It was confirmed by the State Government that the comments/objections and suggestions received from persons and stakeholders in response to the draft notification have been duly considered by the State.

6. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the Committee recommended for finalization of the draft notification.

Furthermore, the Chairman asked the State to expedite submission of remaining ESZ proposal pending with the Government of Arunachal Pradesh, which includes Rube Supse Sanctuary, Dayang Ering Wildlife Sanctuary, Itanagar Sanctuary, Sessa Orchid Sanctuary, Pakke Tiger Reserve, Namdapha Tiger Reserve, Mehao Wildlife Sanctuary, Tale Valley Wildlife Sanctuary for consideration.

4.3 Nandhaur Wildlife Sanctuary Uttarakhand

CCF, Kumaon, Ms....., Government of Uttarakhand made a presentation on

the proposal. It was informed that the draft ESZ notification of Nandhaur Wildlife Sanctuary was re-published on 22nd May, 2020. The salient features of the draft Eco-sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 269.95 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 540.267 sq km

Proposed Extent : 0.7 kilometre to 15.0 kilometre

2. It was informed that Nandhaur Wildlife Sanctuary comprises of central part of Haldwani Forest Division and western part of Champawat Forest Division. The name of the Sanctuary is derived from Nandhaur River which flows inside the valley.

3. The State Government has requested for few corrections in the draft notification. The draft notification, which refers to two districts viz, Nainital and Champawat districts; need to be amended to three districts namely, Nainital, Champawat and Udham Singh Nagar districts of Uttarakhand.

4. The Committee examined the demarcation features of the ESZ boundary around the protected area. It was further suggested that inclusion of three beats namely Majgai, Nakhatal, and Nagra beats of Kilpura-Khatima-Surai Corridor could improve protection and management of ESZ, if not already included in the draft notification. Nonetheless, State Government informed that the present ESZ boundary was demarcated well at the pre-eminent level of the State Government and state will provide elucidation if those beats are not included in the draft notification.

5. It was confirmed by the State Government that the Comments/objections and suggestions received from persons and stakeholders in response to the draft notification have been duly considered.

6. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the committee recommended for finalization of the draft with the above mentioned correction on the PA's location statement and verification on the 3 beats suggested by the experts.

The Chairman further urged the State Government to submit the remaining ESZ proposals, which are pending from State viz, Kedarnath Musk Deer Sanctuary, Valley of flowers National Park, Govind Pushu National Park, Mussurie Wildlife Sanctuary, etc.

4.4 Gorumara National Park West Bengal

Dr V.N Rajashekhar, Forest Department, Government of West Bengal made a presentation on the proposal. It was mentioned that the draft ESZ notification of Gorumara National Park was published on 4th June, 2020. The salient features of the draft Eco-sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 79.99 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 209.99 sq km

Proposed Extent : 2.50 kilometre to 5.00 kilometre

2. Gorumara National Park is located on the right side of National Highway in the Jalpaiguri district of West Bengal. The National Park recorded number of Schedule-I species including Indian elephant, gaur, Chinese pangolin, leopard, Indian rock python, Malayan giant squirrel, leopard cat etc. The great Indian one horned Rhinoceros (*Rhinoceros unicornis*) is the key species of the National Park. It was informed that no comments/objections were received from the stakeholders / public on the draft.

4. The representative of the State mentioned that the proposed ESZ extent has uniform 5 km extent with total ESZ area of 318.60 sq km. The chairman of the committee however pointed that the extent and area of ESZ in the draft notification for Gorumara National Park is 2.50 kms to 5.00 kms and 209.99 sq km. The area statement in the draft notification was published based on the additional information submitted by the State Govt. on its letter no. C-65003/01/2019/VII dated 12.04.2019.

5. The State Government however clarified that revision in extent and area of ESZ has been made after the said communication letter and the same 'now stands as 5km uniform around the National Park and 318.60 sq km, respectively'.

6. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the Committee recommended for finalization of the draft subject to submission of requisite extent and area of ESZ by the State Government.

In addition, the Chairman informed State about six ESZ proposals of West Bengal viz, Sundarbans Wildlife Sanctuary, Sajnekhali Sanctuary Wildlife Sanctuary, West Sundarban Wildlife Sanctuary, Holiday Island Wildlife Sanctuary, Lothian Island Wildlife Sanctuary, Jorepokhri Wildlife Sanctuary, which are still pending with the State Government. The Chairman urged the state to expedite the submission of said proposals.

4.5 Chakrashila Wildlife Sanctuary, Assam

Shri. M.K. Yadav, Forest Department, Govt. of Assam made a presentation on the proposal. It was mentioned that the draft ESZ notification of Chakrashila Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 4th June, 2020. The salient features of the draft Eco-sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 45.568 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 251.031 sq km

Proposed Extent : 76.27 meter to 8.79 kilometre

2. The Chakrasila Wildlife Sanctuary is located in Dhubri and Kokrajhar districts of Assam and is now part of the Bodoland Territorial Council (BTC). The Sanctuary is the only area dedicated to endemic & endangered species of Golden Langur (*Trachypithecus geei*) and has good number of its population. It also supports the diverse faunal diversity including 20 species of mammals, 13 species of amphibians, 10 of reptiles, 109 species of avifauna.

3. It was informed that the proposed ESZ includes certain adjoining landscape

such as south of Bhutan-Manas landscape, reserved forest, protected forest, and also connected to water bodies of Bheels and river. The extent of ESZ that range from 76.27 meters is due to road which has been taken as natural boundaries of the ESZ. The Committee pointed out that the measurement of the extent is too close to digits of centimetres (0.27 m=270cm). The representative of the state agreed for rectification of the same and submission of clarification in this regard.

4. The Committee revealed the importance of Sanctuary for Golden Langur and appreciated the nature of delineation, as it includes most of the adjoining forest area with proper demarcation limited by natural boundaries.

5. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the Committee recommended for finalisation of the draft notification subject to change in the extent of the ESZ pointed out in paragraph 3 above.

4.6 Dehing Patkai Wildlife Sanctuary, Assam

Shri. M.K. Yadav, Forest Department, Government of Assam made a presentation on the proposal. It was informed that the draft ESZ notification of Dehing Patkai Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 30th May, 2019. The salient features of the draft Eco-sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 111.19 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 215.82 sq km

Proposed Extent : Zero to 7.5 kilometre

2. Dehing Patkai Wildlife Sanctuary is located at Dibrugarh and Tinsukia Civil Districts of Assam. Previously, the ESZ proposal of Dehing Patkai Wildlife Sanctuary was considered in the 37th Expert Committee Meeting held on 30th Sep. 2019. During the said meeting, committee suggested for submission of revised draft with restriction of drilling activities upto 1 km. The state govt. has submitted the revised proposal with ESZ extent ranging from 0 to 5.5 kilometres with ESZ area of 167.55 sq km.

3. The representative of the State Govt informed that Dehing Patkai Wildlife Sanctuary is under consideration for getting upgraded to National Park very soon. Accordingly, It was requested to the Committee to suggest if the ESZ to be notified now or after the change of status to National Park. The Committee noted that with upgradation to National Park, there is possibility of additional area in the ESZ; accordingly the proposed ESZ will be considered.

4. After detailed deliberations, the Committee recommended for submission of revised draft notification of Dehing Patkai after its upgradation to National Park.

5. The Chairman asked the State Government to expedite other ESZ proposals, which are pending from the Government of Assam namely, Borail Wildlife Sanctuary, Panidehing Wildlife Sanctuary, Rajiv Gandhi Orang Wild Life Sanctuary, Panidehing Sanctuary Wild Life Sanctuary, Kaziranga National Park, Manas National Park and Barnadi Sanctuary, Deepor Beel Wildlife Sanctuary, Pobitora Wild Life

Sanctuary, Bordoibam-Beelmukh Sanctuary, Marat Longri Sanctuary and Bherjan Borajan Wildlife Sanctuar, Assam. The submission of State Government regarding zero extent all around Bherjan Borajan Wildlife Sanctuary was not accepted by the Committee and suggested State Government for revisiting the proposal.

4.7 Dalma Wildlife Sanctuary Jharkhand

Shri. S.K Suman, Forest Department, Government of Jharkhand attended the meeting. It was mentioned that the ESZ final notification of Dalma Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 29th March, 2012 with extent of 0 (zero) to 5 kms having 51 villages inside the ESZ. The State Government has now requested for amendment in the notification by exclusion of 13 villages justifying that those villages are situated beyond 10 kms wherein 5 kms is the maximum extent of the ESZ.

2. The Committee informed that previously the proposal was also discussed earlier during meeting of the 39th Expert Committee on ESZ when the State Government was suggested for validations of the village's location along with their geo-coordinates & maps. The said meeting recommended for amendment, subject to submission of requisite maps marked with villages' location & geo-coordinates by the State Govt. for authentication. However, the requisite information is still awaited from the State Government.

3. In the absence of information, authentication and amendment couldn't be done. The representative of the State assured that the requisite information will be submitted soon to the Ministry.

4. Accordingly, the committee recommended for submission of required information within 20 days for consideration of amendment of the notification by the Ministry.

4.8 Sri Venkateshwara National Park & Wildlife Sanctuary, Andhra Pradesh

Shri. N Prateep Kumar, IFS PCCF, Government of Andhra Pradesh made a presentation on the proposal. It was mentioned that the draft ESZ notification of Sri Venkateshwara National Park & Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 22nd January, 2019. The salient features of the draft Eco-sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 525.97 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 992.45 sq km

Proposed Extent : 0 to 10 kilometre

It was informed that Sri Venkateswara Wildlife Sanctuary and National Park are situated in Chittoor and Kadapa Districts of Andhra Pradesh. The Committee inquired whether the ESZ proposal is for Sri Venkateswara Wildlife Sanctuary alone or both Sri Venkateswara National Park and Wildlife Sanctuary. The representative clarified that the present ESZ proposal comprised of both Sri Venkateswara National Park and Wildlife Sanctuary.

2. The draft ESZ notification of the Sanctuary was considered during the 35th

meeting of the Expert Committee on ESZ held on 3rd June 2019. During the meeting, the State Government had sought deferment of the proposal for certain changes, such as keeping out few villages including Tirumala from the proposed Eco-sensitive Zone. He further informed that the proposal was considered by the District Level Committee, which endorsed certain changes such as exclusion of approx. 10-15 sq km enclosures area and providing 100 m buffer around such enclosure. The District Level Committee also decided to exclude two more villages namely, Mamandur and Kukkaladoddi villages due to location of food processing industries. Furthermore, during the district level meeting, it was decided to exclude few areas like Karakambadi, Chennaiagh kunta and Kapilatheertham falling in Tirupati Town.

3. The Committee opined that the declaration of ESZ doesn't mean complete restriction or prohibition of development activities, it provides for regulation of certain activities. The committee understands the importance for the exclusion of Tirumala villages; although exclusion of other adjoining areas for the purpose of development activities will not be appropriate. Therefore, the State Government was asked to submit revised proposal with proper justification.

4. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the Committee asked State Government for submission of revised proposal to the Ministry at the earliest for its timely finalization.

In addition, the Chairman further urged the State to expedite the submission of ESZ proposals, which are pending with the State Government namely, Coringa Wildlife Sanctuary, Gundla Brahmeshwaram Wildlife Sanctuary, Kolleru Wildlife Sanctuary, Papikinda National Park, etc.

4.9 Kesu Brahmananda Reddy National Park Telangana

APCCF, Telangana, Forest Department, Government of Telangana made a presentation on the proposal. It was mentioned that the draft ESZ notification of Kesu Brahmananda Reddy National Park was published on 30th October, 2018. The salient features of the draft Eco-sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 1.42 sq km

Proposed ESZ area: 0.0582 sq km

Proposed Extent : 0.003 to 0.0298 kilometre

2. Previously, the ESZ proposal for Kesu Brahmananda Reddy National Park was considered during the 33rd meeting of the Expert Committee on ESZ held on 28th Feb 2019. During the meeting, the Committee suggested to explore the area and revise the ESZ extent by allowing flyover under regulated activities and asked the State to submit detailed report of the public hearing. The requisite information is still pending from the State Government.

3. The representative of the State responded that the National Park is located at the middle of the city and the National Park is fully protected all around with high ornamental grill wall. It was also mentioned that State Government has Master Plan for the city. While inquiring the available fauna of the National Park, State has

informed that jungle cat, hare, porcupine, civets, pangolin, are the prominent fauna of the area. Public hearing for the proposed ESZ was conducted and the requisite information is delayed due to pandemic situation.

4. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the Committee recommended the proposal for finalization of the draft.

The Committee further requested for submission of the pending ESZ proposals from the State of Telangana. The ESZ proposals of Kawal Tiger Reserve, Siwaram Crocodile Sanctuary, Amrabad Tiger Reserve, Eturnagaram Wildlife Sanctuary, Pranahita Wildlife Sanctuary, Mrugavani National Park are pending from the State, which needs to be submitted.

4.10 Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary Maharashtra

Shri Virendra Tiwari, APCCF Government of Maharashtra, apprised the Committee about the proposal. It was informed that the draft ESZ notification of Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary was published on 6th November, 2019. The salient features of the draft Eco-Sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 16.90 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 34.05 sq km

Proposed Extent : 0 to 3.50 kilometres

2. The proposal for Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary was considered during the 39th meeting of the Expert Committee on ESZ held on 04.02.2020. During the meeting, the Committee suggested the State Government to revise the proposal by exploring the possibility of including the forest area in ESZ. The revised proposal has been pending with State Government since February 2020.

3. In this regard, the APCCF informed that the revised ESZ proposal of Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary has been submitted to the State Government for approval in May, 2020. It was informed that the proposal will be submitted to the Ministry within 15 days. The Chairman emphasised for pursuing the matter with State Government and facilitate early submission of the revised proposal.

4. While reviewing the other pending proposals, the State Government was asked to submit the revised proposal of Nandur Madhmeshwar WLS. Also the State was requested to expedite the submission of the pending ESZ proposals for Bor Wildlife Sanctuary, Deolgaon-Rehekuri WLS, Malvan WLS, Esapur WLS and Sahyadri Tiger Reserve to the Ministry.

4.11 Karlapat Wildlife Sanctuary Odisha

Shri. Mihir Biswal, DFO, Govt. of Odisha apprised the Committee about the proposal. It was informed that the draft ESZ notification of Karlapat Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 9th August, 2019. The salient features of the draft Eco-Sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 147.66 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 939.58 sq km

Proposed Extent : 0 to 10 kilometres

2. It was mentioned that the proposal was earlier considered during the 37th meeting of the Expert Committee on ESZ held on 17.12.2019. During the meeting, the State Government has mentioned that rationalization of Protected Area(PA) is under process and accordingly the Committee recommended for submission of revised proposal after rationalisation of the PA. The Committee also suggested for extending the ESZ extent. The said information was pending from State Government, since December, 2019.

3. The representative of the State Government informed that rationalization for the area of Karlapat Wildlife Sanctuary is still under process and under consultation with the NBWL. Since it is time taking process, State Government requested for more time for validation of the area under the PA. The Committee accepted the request of the State Government and asked them to expedite submission of the revised proposal.

4. While reviewing the other proposals, the State Government was asked to submit the revised proposals of Simplipal Tiger Reserve and Kotagarh WLS, Baisipalli WLS and Satkosia Tiger Reserve, which are long pending for want of information for further consideration by Expert Committee.

5. Additionally, the State Government informed about Chilka lake proposal, which has been submitted to State Wetland Authority for vetting and its approval for Notification at State level is under the provisions of Wetlands Rules.

4.12 Bassi Wildlife Sanctuary, Rajasthan

Shri. Arindum Tomar, PCCF, Government of Rajasthan apprised the Committee about the proposal. It was informed that the draft ESZ notification of Bassi Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 4th November, 2019. The salient features of the draft Eco-Sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 138.69 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 108.00 sq km

Proposed Extent : 0 (zero) to 3.00 kilometres

2. It was mentioned that previously the proposal was considered during the 39th meeting of the Expert Committee on ESZ held on 4th Feb. 2020. During the meeting, State Government sought deferment for the purpose of consultation with stakeholders. The information is still pending from the State Government since February, 2020.

3. While asking the firm timeline, the representative of State Government informed that they are planning to submit outcome of the public consultation report along with the proposal on or before 5th Sept. 2020.

4. Based on the discussions held, the committee accepted the request of State Government for deferment and asked them for early submission of the proposal.

4.13 Mount Abu Wildlife Sanctuary Rajasthan

Shri. Arindum Tomar, PCCF, Government of Rajasthan apprised the Committee about the proposal. It was informed that the draft ESZ notification of Mount Abu Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 3rd June, 2019. The salient features of the draft Eco-Sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 326.09 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 125.15 sq km

Proposed Extent : 100 meters to 6.08 kilometre

2. Mount Abu Wildlife Sanctuary is situated in Sirohi district of Rajasthan close to the borders of Gujarat. Mount Abu is a unique ecosystem due to its altitudinal variations. The proposal was earlier considered during the 37th meeting of Expert Committee on ESZ held on 30.09.2019. During the meeting, the Committee asked the State Government to revise the ESZ extent, at least one kilometre from the boundaries of the Sanctuary. The proposal was reconsidered during the 40th meeting of the Expert Committee on ESZ held on 16.03.2020, when the State Government sought deferment stating that consultation process has been initiated through District Collector, Sirohi.

3. The PCCF informed that public consultation process has been completed and the report along with the proposal has been submitted to the State Government for approval in July 2020. He further explained that 100 meters' extent of ESZ has been proposed at limited stretches against periphery of the WLS due to urban development and at rest of the places extent is kept for 1.0 Km with widest maximum extent of ESZ upto 6.08 kilometre. The Comments/objections and suggestions received from persons and stakeholders in response to the draft notification have been duly considered by the State Government. The State was advised to give proper justification for 100 meters' extent of ESZ and letter from Collector on public consultation to the Ministry at the earliest.

4. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the committee recommended for finalization of the draft proposal subject to submission of above information.

Further, the State Government was asked to submit the revised proposal for Shergarh, Tal Chapar and National Chambal WLSs, which are pending with the State. Also the State Government was reminded for Ranthambore ESZ proposal, Sariska Tiger Reserve, Desert National Park and Ramgarh Vishdhari SWLS, which are yet to be submitted by State Govt.

4.14 Mahavir Swami Wildlife Sanctuary Uttar Pradesh

Shri Sunil Chaudhary, APCCF, W.L. Forest Department, Government of Uttar Pradesh apprised the Committee about the proposal. It was informed that the draft

ESZ notification of Mahavir Swami Wildlife Sanctuary was published on 3rd June, 2019. The salient features of the draft Eco-Sensitive Zone (ESZ) are as follows:

Area of PA : 5.4108 sq km

Proposed ESZ area : 6.8592 sq km

Proposed Extent : 1 kilometre uniform

2. Mahavir Swami Wildlife Sanctuary is situated in Lalit Pur district of Uttar Pradesh spread over an area of 5.4108 square kilometres. Previously, the proposal was considered during the 37th meeting of the Expert Committee on ESZ held on 30.09.2019. During the meeting the Committee recommended for finalization of the proposal. Later, based on many representations received from VIPs and public regarding the ambiguity in area of Protected Area(PA), the matter was again considered during the 40th meeting of the Expert Committee held on 16th March, 2020. During the meeting, the State Government representative admitted that there is some discrepancy in the area of PA and the State Government is working on its rationalization. Based on discussions held during the meeting, the Committee asked the State Government to expedite early rationalization of boundaries of PA with proper ground reality/testimony, in commensurate with ESZ area so that final Notification could be issued on time.

3. During the present meeting, the State Government has informed that the area of the Sanctuary is correct, as mentioned in the draft notification (i.e. 5.4108 sq km). There were some error in the geo-coordinates and map of the Sanctuary as some area of Madhya Pradesh was wrongly included in the proposed ESZ. The corrected geo-coordinates and map will be submitted to the Ministry soon. The comments/objections and suggestions received from persons and stakeholders in response to the draft notification have been duly considered by the State and replies submitted by the State Government. The corrected geo-coordinates and map has now been submitted by the State Government.

5. Based on the presentation made and discussions held, the committee recommended for finalization of the draft Notification.

While discussing the status of other proposal, the State Government was requested to submit the revised proposal for Sohewla WLS and Kachchua WLS. In response, the APCCF referred that Kachchua WLS has been de-notified by State Government. Additionally, the State was also asked to submit the pending ESZ proposals of Katarniaghat Sancatuary, Dudhwa National Park, Kishanpur Sanctuary. Dr. Bhimrao Ambedkar Bird Sanctuary and Pilibhit Sanctuary to the Ministry at the earliest.

5. Based on the deliberations and discussions held on the draft notifications and also on the comments/suggestions/objections received from stakeholders/public, the Expert Committee recommended the following:

S. No.	Protected Area	State	Recommendation of Expert Committee
--------	----------------	-------	------------------------------------

1..	Karnataka	Thimlapura Wildlife Sanctuary	Committee recommended for finalization of the draft with certain changes.
2..	Arunachal Pradesh	Dibang Wildlife Sanctuary	Committee recommended for finalization of the draft.
3..	Uttarakhand	Nandhaur Wildlife Sanctuary	Committee recommended for finalization of the draft with few correction and verification.
4..	West Bengal	Gorumara National Park	Recommended for finalization of the draft with submission of detail clarification on ESZ extent & area.
5..	Assam	Chakrashila Wildlife Sanctuary	Committee recommended for finalization of the draft.
6..	Assam	Dehing Patkai Wildlife Sanctuary	Committee recommended for submission of revised draft notification.
7..	Jharkhand	Dalma Wildlife Sanctuary	Committee recommended for submission of requisite information within 20 days for amending the notification.
8..	Andhra Pradesh	Sri Venkateshwara National Park & Wildlife Sanctuary	Recommended for submission of the revised proposal.
9..	Telangana	Kesu Brahmananda Reddy National Park	Recommended for submission of the revised proposal along with the appropriate write up justification.
10..	Maharashtra	Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary	Deferred .
11..	Odisha	Karlapat Wildlife Sanctuary	Deferred.
12..	Rajasthan	Bassi Wildlife Sanctuary	Deferred and suggested for early submission of the proposal with public consultation report.
13..	Rajasthan	Mount Abu Wildlife Sanctuary	Recommended for finalization of draft notification subject to submission of suitable justification of the 100 meters ESZ extent.
14..	Uttar Pradesh	Mahavir Swami Wildlife Sanctuary	Recommended for finalization of draft notification subject to submission of corrected geo-coordinates and map of the Sanctuary.

42nd Expert Committee Meeting on ESZ held on 18.08.2020

List of Participants

S. No.	Name	Designation & Organization
1.	Shri Ravi Aggarwal	Additional Secretary, MoEF&CC
2.	Dr. Satish C. Garkoti	Scientist 'G', MoEF&CC
3.	Sh. Lalit Kumar Bokolia	Director, MoEF&CC
4.	Dr. Shruti Rai Bhardwaj	Additional Director, MoEF&CC
5.	Dr. Veenu Joon	Joint Director, MoEF&CC
6.	Dr. Shaikhom I Singh	Consultant ESZ , MoEF&CC
7.	Dr. S. A. Hussain,	Scientist 'G', WII, Dehradun
8.	Shri. Sanjay K. Agarwal,	Deputy Director, Forest Survey of India, Dehradun
9.	Vishaish Uppal,	Director, WWF India
10.	DR. C. Raghunathan	Scientist 'E' Zoological Survey of India
11.	Dr. Hitendra Padalia	Indian Institute of Remote Sensing (IIRS)
12.	Dr. K. Chandrasekar, Scientist-E,	G.B. Pant National Institute of Himalayan Environment & Sustainable Development
13.	Dr. K. Shankar	Director SACON
14.	R.K. Singh, Director, DoLR MoRD	DoLR MoRD
15.	Dr. Sanjay Singh, Scientist 'D', ICFRE	Scientist 'D', ICFRE
State Govt.		
16.	Sh. Arindam Tomar	Government of Rajasthan
17.	M.K. Yadav,	PCCF, Government of Assam
18.	Ajai Mishra,	PCCF Govt. of Karnataka
19.	Shri. H.S. Upadhyaya,	CWLW, Govt. of Odisha
20.	Shri. Mihir Biswal,	DFO, Govt. of Odisha
21.	Shri. J C Joshi	CF Western
22.	Joy Thakur	
23.	K. Ranganathan	
24.	N Prateep Kumar,	IFS PCCF, Govt. of Andhra Pradesh

25.	P.V. Chalapathi Rao	
26.	Shri. G. Kumar,	PCCF, Govt. of Arunachal Pradesh
27.	Pradipta Baruah	
28.	Shri. Dr V.N Rajashekhar,	Forest Department, Govt. of West Bengal
29.	Shri. S.K Suman,	Forest Department, Govt. of Jharkhand
30.	Sanjay Singh	
31.	Virendra Tiwari	APCCF, Govt. of Maharashtra
32.	Alok Paul Kaisi	
33.	Sri Sidhanand Kukrety, APCCF Prod. Telangana	Govt. of Telangana
34.	Ashutosh Jaiswal	Govt. of Uttar Pradesh
35.	Sunil Chaudhary,	APCCF, W.L. Forest Department Govt. of Uttar Pradesh
36.	Shri. Sunil Chaudhary,	APCCF, W.L. Forest Department, Govt. of Uttar Pradesh
37.	CCF Kumaon	Govt. of Uttarakhand
38.	Shri. J.S Suhag,	APCCF, Govt. of Uttarakhand
39.	CWLW Uttarakhand	CWLW, Govt. of Uttarakhand
