MANAGING COMMITTEE 2023-2025

PRESIDENT Domnic Romell

IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT Boman Irani

> PRESIDENT-ELECT Ajay Ashar

STRATEGIC ADVISOR Abhishek Lodha

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENTS

Parag Shah Jayesh Shah Sukhraj Nahar Sandeep Raheja Rasesh Kanakia

VICE PRESIDENTS

Bandish Ajmera Shailesh Puranik Pritam Chivukula **Amit Thacker** Jackbastian Nazareth

> SECRETARY **Dhaval Ajmera**

TREASURER Nikunj Sanghavl

JOINT SECRETARIES

Tejas Vyas **Pratik Patel** Sunny Bijlani Rushi Mehta

JOINT TREASURER **Gurminder Singh Seera**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Shahid Balwa Subodh Runwal Parag Munot Nainesh Shah Mukesh Patel Munish Doshi Raajesh Prajapati Parth Mehta Harmohan Sahni Jayvardhan Goenka Úmang Kuwadia rashant Khandelwal **Binitha Dalal** Avushi Ashar Samyag Shah Ricardo Romell

SPECIAL ADVISORS Ar. Hafeez Contractor Adv. Parimal Shroff Anui Puri

STATISTICS AND RESEARCH Dr. Adv. Harshul Savla

INVITEE MEMBERS

Rahul Sagar Ramkrishna Raheja Nishant Agarwa Harsh Hiranandani Ajay Nahar Azim F. Tapia Cherag Ramakrishnan Vijay Lakhani Jayesh Chauhan **Aditya Shah** Shraddha Goradia Sudhanshu Agarwal Hussain Lalani Sahil Parikh Aditya Mirchandani Rushi Ajmera

YOUTHWING CONVENOR Naman Shah

PROCUREMENT CONVENOR Nimish Almera

WOMEN'S WING CHAIRPERSON Jesal Shah



Ref. No.: MCHI/PRES/24-25/136

Date: 15/10/2024

To

Dr. Bhushan Gagrani (I.A.S.). Municipal Commissioner,

Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation,

Fort, Mumbai - 400 0001

Respected Sir,



Reg; 1) Review of Guidelines / Approvals for Bldg., Construction in the Vicinity of Defence Establishments.

2) Letter No. 40/PC 125/2023/NV-11 from Department of Urban Development, Ministry to Slum Rehab Authority, Bandra dated 03rd November 2023.

We invite your attention to Letter dated 3rd November 2023 from Dept. of Urban Development wherein it has been mentioned that the Advocate General, state of Maharashtra had opined that Defence Circulars dated 18.05.2011; 18 Month 2015; 17th November 2015; and 23rd December 2022 were quashed and set aside by the court. Therefore, in our opinion, neither 2011 guidelines can be applied nor can 2016 guidelines can be applied today.

It has also come to our attention recently of another judgement by the Honorable Supreme Court on a Special Leave Petition No. 13483/2024 I filed by the Ministry of Defence who were aggrieved by the order of the Writ Petition 3145 of 2021 in High Court and the Order passed by learned Judge M.V Chandvani J and Sunil B. Shukre J. as below reproduced:

"In the present case, we have found that the aforesaid circulars of the Ministry of Defence are not even in the nature of executive instructions. Rather, they fall under a category of only departmental circulars binding upon the officers of the department and not the outsider or third parties. This category is even below the category of executive instructions of the Central Government, which instructions would operate until otherwise provided by Parliament, as provided under Article 73(2) of the Constitution of India. It would then follow that the law applicable to the executive instructions in a case, would be applicable with even greater force to the office circulars which are not issued in the name of the "President", contrary to mandate of Article 77(I) of the Constitution of India. For this reason also, the afore stated circulars cannot be relied upon by the petitioner so as to make an attempt to restrict the right of the petitioner to enjoy it's property, which includes right to make construction in accordance with the permission granted in that regard by the Competent Authority, which permission is already granted to the petitioner ay back on 8th August 2008."

The Honorable Supreme Court by Hon'ble MRS. JUSTICE B.V. NAGARTHNA and Hon'ble MR. JUSTICE NONGEIKAPAM KOTISWAR SINGH has rejected and dismissed the Special Leave Petition with the following order:

"Having regard to facts and circumstances of this case, we are not inclined to interfere in the matter. The Special Leave Petition is hence dismissed". (Copy of Order is enclosed).

Maharashtra Chamber of Housing Industry

Maker Bhavan II, 4th Floor, 18, V. Thackersey Marg, New Marine Lines, Mumbai - 400 020 Tel: 42121421, Fax: 4212 1411/407 Email: secretariat@mchi.net Website: www.mchi.net



As you are aware more than 200 Projects have been stalled which is not only a heavy financial loss to the Developers, but also unsurmountable difficulties to Individuals entitled to their Homes - a combination of both converts into heavy loss to the Real Estate Industry as well as County's Economy.

In light of above judgements, we request your goodself to consider granting Approvals/Sanctions of Redevelopment Projects which have been stalled for want of NOC from Defence.

Yours sincerely,

For CREDAI-MCHI

Domnic Romell

President

Dhaval Ajmera

Hon. Secretary

PS: Contact Person Mr. Sanjay Phope: 96193 45193